

ORIGINAL

TOWN OF ENFIELD

OF

PUBLIC HEARING ON BLACK OAK WIND FARMS DSEIS

ON

Monday, March 28, 2016

@

7:00 p.m.

Baker Transcription Service
321 Troy Road
Ithaca, New York 14850
Telephone: (607) 207-6332

1 **UNKNOWN:** Okay I want to introduce the board first we
2 have Virginia Bryant Town Council. Virginia is leaving early
3 tonight on family matters herself. We have Mike Carpenter
4 out back. He'll be directing seat traffic for us for a
5 while. We have Michael Miles; we have Henry Hansteen, and
6 Alice Linton, Town Clerk and she'll be taking notes on all
7 your comments tonight and (inaudible) for us. So thanks,
8 Alice. Before I read this, sorry, before I read this you all
9 got a copy of the town hearing. It was brought to my
10 attention that within the first two sentences it says the
11 purpose of this public hearing is (inaudible) the town board
12 can hear the public opinion on the completeness of the
13 supplemental draft environmental impact statement. It's
14 actually supposed to say the content of it, not the
15 completeness. I'm going to (inaudible) continue with all of
16 it just in case people did not get a copy. The purpose of
17 this public hearing is for the Enfield Town Board to hear the
18 public opinion on the supplemental draft environmental impact
19 statement on some modifications that the Black Oak wind farm
20 has made to their project lay out, specifically to
21 potentially relocate two of the approved wind turbines to one
22 of three purposed locations as well as relocate a substation
23 and a permanent wind measurement tower just south of turbine
24 four and relocate approximately 8,400 linear feet of buried
25 collection line, but except this (inaudible) the project

1 would otherwise remain as consisting of seven wind turbines
2 generating 16.1 megawatts of electricity utilizing the GE two
3 point three 107 model wind turbines. Black Oak wind farm's
4 environmental people, Hailey Aldridge, with additions made by
5 our environmental engineers, the bell associates, have
6 presented the Enfield Town Board with a draft EIS regarding
7 these purposed changes and the board sent with document a
8 substantial complaint and ready for public comment on March
9 ninth two thousand sixteen. The document is also available
10 online at www.blackoakwindfarmny.com and a hard copy is at
11 the Enfield Town Hall and the Tompkins County public library.
12 The town is then required to open (inaudible) period and have
13 a public hearing for the purpose of hearing from interested
14 people (inaudible) as to the completeness of the draft EIS.
15 This period commenced on March 12, 2016 and has been extended
16 to April 22, 2016, with an additional public hearing being
17 scheduled for April 12th starting at 7:00, the same location
18 as we are now. The public hearing tonight has the following
19 requirements from the public: All attendees must sign in and
20 that's for attendance purposes, which is what Sue has been
21 doing outside the gym doors, speakers shall form an orderly
22 line in front of the microphone, speakers shall, shall
23 clearly state their name, address and organization if they
24 represent if any, speakers are allowed to speak once for a
25 maximum of three minutes and Henry will do time. So if you

1 are not sure how long you've been speaking, he'll cue you in.
2 Speakers should try not to repeat previous subjects that have
3 been addressed, comments should be confined to topics
4 addressed in the draft as CEIS the issues with the turbines
5 and the ones that are listed in the SEIS. If you make
6 comments on any other like past or any other issues you may
7 make comments, but that will not necessarily be addressed.
8 It is what has been on this draft that needs to get addressed
9 for this evening. Speakers should address all remarks to the
10 board as a body and not to any member thereof. Speakers
11 shall observe the commonly accepted rules of courtesy,
12 decorum, dignity and good taste. No one in the audience is
13 to interrupt the speaker at the microphone. Interested
14 parties or their representatives may address the board by
15 written communications. A few other things, this is not a
16 question and answer session. It is just a comment session.
17 That needs to be clear. There is a map in the back of the
18 room that has the turbines and locations if you need to refer
19 to that in your comment or if you want to look at it
20 afterwards. Let's see? And at the very end we would
21 appreciate if you helped pack away the chairs on the racks
22 for us since the custodian is here only till ten o'clock. I
23 think that was all I needed to address.

24 UNKNOWN: So, form a line and we'll get started.

25

1 **LES BLOBURG:** Hello, my name is Les Blomburg and I'm the
2 executive director of the noise pollution clearing house,
3 it's a national nonprofit dealing with noise issues
4 (inaudible). I have two main comments. The first one is
5 that I've request modeling for the monitoring data that
6 supports the EIS. I have participated in many environmental
7 impact statements and environmental impact reports and such.
8 I have never participated in one in which the modeling and
9 monitoring data has not been provided. This is a common
10 practice. It's kind of like the equivalent of showing your
11 work if you're a school teacher and you're, you're not, the
12 teacher says I want to see your work. This is, this is what
13 it is. This is important to analyzing your results and how
14 they were achieved and the time of production is critical to
15 people being able to analyze. My second major comment deals
16 with the Enfield noise (inaudible). I have it on the slide
17 right here, which you can't see, but basically it says
18 (inaudible) shall not exceed 60 decibels above ambient sound
19 levels . This is the, this is as far as I know the worst,
20 meaning the least protective noise standard in the United
21 States. I'm in the process right now of collecting the noise
22 (inaudible) regulations of 500 (inaudible) towns in the
23 country. I have over 500, but I don't know if I've got all
24 of the 500 hundred largest yet (inaudible), and a number of
25 them regulated with above ambient standards like you use.

1 You at 60 decibels are 45 decibels above the highest
2 (inaudible) other than that. The tie for second place is
3 three different communities, (inaudible) Oklahoma,
4 (inaudible) Wisconsin and West (inaudible) City Utah all at
5 fifteen decibels above ambient. When you combine that with
6 the 39 decibel plus 39.8 decibel background level in the
7 draft (inaudible) you get a level of a hundred decibels.
8 That too is above the highest I've ever seen in a community.
9 A hundred decibels is a noise level that the World Health
10 Organization and EPA have recommended be exposed to for only
11 a minute and half a day with the rest exposure being
12 basically less than 60...

13 **HENRY HANSTEEH:** Ten seconds.

14 **LES BLOBURG:** And so it's very loud, second and third
15 place go to another energy industry influence noise ordinance
16 and that would be (inaudible) Oklahoma and Texas.

17 **HENRY HANSTEEH:** Times up.

18 **LES BLOBURG:** Do you want to hear any more about this or
19 not at all?

20 **UNKNOWN:** Well right three minutes, unfortunately.

21 **LES BLOBURG:** Okay.

22 **UNKNOWN:** What did you say (inaudible) please?

23 **LES BLOBURG:** Well, my time's up.

24 **UNKNOWN:** So you're not from Enfield?
25

1 **JUDE LEMKE:** My name is Jude Lemke I live at 215
2 Connecticut Hill Road, Newfield, but it's in Enfield, mailing
3 and address is Newfield.

4 **UNKNOWN:** Ma'am, can you use the microphone?

5 **JUDE LEMKE:** I'll be following up my comments, but I
6 want to make some point about the process that relates to
7 this, this supplemental EIS. As a citizen, it's hard to
8 understand why this board is pressuring this application
9 through and why there is all this secrecy. It's sort of a
10 game of three card monte. So, I have filed a community
11 freedom of information request and then the board denies my
12 request and then I call my lawyer and the writes and says
13 (inaudible) something when the board sends me stuff, but I'm
14 still waiting for some of my answers to some of my requests
15 including what Les just referenced, which is the sound
16 recordings. It's basic law in this state that all response
17 with the town board is public record and the only explanation
18 for the board behavior is (inaudible) Black Oak more than its
19 citizens or there's been no active review of the supplemental
20 (inaudible). Black Oak tells everybody that change is
21 coming, but after reading the supplemental, I still don't
22 know whether maybe two turbines will be moved, maybe not,
23 maybe two new ones in Enfield, maybe one in Newfield maybe
24 one in Enfield, exactly what's happening is pretty hard to
25 know. The town's accepted this SEIS as complete too soon

1 before any board members could even ready it and now we're
2 stuck with calling it complete. What was the hurry? The
3 board failed to properly notice this hearing and it probably
4 didn't properly notice the hearing in 2013. Why not? Aren't
5 our citizens entitled to know about this hearing? This
6 shouldn't be like pulling teeth it's the board's job to
7 protect its citizens. Our wind laws is a joke. My noise
8 expert has never even heard of maximum noise limit as high as
9 Enfield's. The setbacks are ridiculous. The board needs to
10 enact a moratorium give our citizen noise limits and setbacks
11 in line with those dozens of other towns in this state. The
12 board has the power to change the law retroactively. Despite
13 Black Oaks claim to the contrary, they do not have invested
14 rights. This law can be changed retroactively and should be.
15 Black Oak hasn't done anything in a year and it's their
16 fault. It is not the town boards fault. As citizens of this
17 town you should be contacting your board members and demand
18 that they slow this process down, put a moratorium in place
19 and like, just like Newfield's do and put safe setbacks and
20 noise limits in place. Thanks.

21 **JOHN RANCICH:** I'm John Rancich and I started this
22 progress in 2002. I brought this, this project to this
23 board. Not this particular board, but the town board of
24 (inaudible). I've been a resident of Hines Road for near
25 forty years. This is one of the worse financial things I

1 have ever done for myself, but still the very best thing that
2 could happen for this town and I think the supplement EIS is
3 very complete. We've been at this for 14 years. We don't
4 need to wait any longer. We've done years and years of that,
5 thousands of meetings and, and spent hundreds of thousands of
6 dollars doing things the right way and I believe it's done
7 right and I urge the board to go along with this process and
8 we're going to end up, we're going to have many, many years
9 of megawatts of clean, renewable energy and we're going to
10 provide jobs and income to the town and the school districts
11 and it's all good.

12 **SUSAN MALTER:** My name is Susan Malter. I live in the
13 town of Ithaca. I'm just a little bit down the road on
14 seventy nine. I just wanted to make two points. For the
15 first, I'm speaking as a former assistant professor at Monroe
16 Community College in Rochester. On the first day of every
17 class, I taught my students don't believe everything you read
18 in print or online or everything you hear and see on
19 television and the reason. My comment here is, is in
20 response to the last hearing at which many residence spoke of
21 studies. Who wrote these studies? Who funded those studies?
22 Were they published in peer reviewed journals? And if those
23 people who were quoting the studies would get the answers to
24 those questions they might find out the people who are
25 against wind power have created those studies to support

1 their point-of-view and that makes the point suspect. My
2 second point, before my second point I'm speaking as a social
3 worker, which I've been all my adult life and a cancer
4 survivor of several cancers. No one, we can't control what
5 happens to us in life, but we can control how we respond to
6 it. It doesn't matter whether the, it is a diagnosis of
7 cancer or whether it's a wind farm coming into our town and
8 somebody thinks that's not a good idea. As psychologists and
9 other professionals have long known, when you have negative
10 thoughts about something it creates negative feelings and the
11 negative feelings can suppress (inaudible) system so that it
12 doesn't find out for use like it usually does. So let's use
13 my two examples, my being diagnosed with cancer and somebody
14 who thinking that the wind farm's a bad idea. If we continue
15 to think negatively it hurts us, but if with cancer you say
16 there is a life after cancer, there are things that I can do
17 to improve my quality of life as long as I'm alive whether
18 it's nutrition or exercise or friendship or whatever and if
19 you think the wind farm is a bad idea you look at the points
20 that the (inaudible) revised EIS draft tells us that this
21 wind farm proposal has been changed several times in response
22 to the peoples' concerns and with fewer wind turbines built
23 and setbacks were changed and that can make us feel good and
24 positive and thankful to the board and to Black Oak Wind
25 Farms for doing this.

1 **DAWN DRAKE:** I am Dawn Drake from (inaudible) Griffin
2 road I grew up in Enfield and was born here raised here, I
3 also have a chronic illness. I have rheumatoid arthritis,
4 fibromyalgia and kind of sensitive to noise (inaudible) we're
5 not against wind farms. We're against them right next to our
6 homes. I live on one of five Griffin Road. I have lived up
7 here with my husband for the last 27 years. We have built
8 our dream home. We have a beautiful pond out back. I'm
9 mainly concerned about the level noise these wind turbines
10 are going to be producing. I do not want to hear these in my
11 backyard when I'm gardening or standing back by my pond or
12 when (inaudible) trying to sleep. Should I not have to give
13 up my person way of life (inaudible) here not everyone is
14 going to be happy like I've being hearing from our
15 supervisor. This was supposed to be a community project.
16 Now almost all my neighbors are (inaudible) right now scared
17 living in fear of these being constructed so close to their
18 homes. Like I have said before I am all for green
19 alternative energy but the output is that (inaudible) several
20 neighbors in a way that they're scared to live (inaudible)
21 this isn't right. Why should our health safety and our way
22 of life be sacrificed for an interest (inaudible) industrial
23 project? I don't want to worry the rest of my life
24 (inaudible) for the rest of my life. Please hear our
25 concerns. Our concern (inaudible) everyday about living in

1 our homes. Put yourself in our shoes in this situation
2 (inaudible). Would you then understand? Thank you.

3 **ROBERT TESORI:** Thank you for the hearing tonight. My
4 names Robert Tesori, 27 Black Oak Road. One of my biggest
5 concerns with the new proposal is turbine C. Turbine two was
6 abandoned. That was right next to our property and aside
7 from the safety, and health issues of being so close, it was
8 a property infringement. As far as the safety zone it cut
9 through our property a couple of acres and I asked a question
10 on the 17th of December what if I want to build, which
11 actually I do, in the back of the property would it be
12 allowed and I don't believe I would be issued a building
13 permit to do that if that was right next to it. So, it's
14 been said that turbine two was moved in response to our
15 concerns, which I know is not true. Turbine two was moved
16 because it wasn't allowed to be moved. Now turbine C, which
17 is on the corner of Black Oak and Harvey Hill, I've learned
18 that one of the property owners down there would like to
19 subdivide the back of their property up into two five acres
20 parcels for their family and now they can't. So, while I'm
21 grateful that we could do what we want with our property, now
22 somebody else is having the same problem that we were. The
23 other point that I wanted to make is the town of Enfield, or
24 excuse me, the town of Newfield just passed through a 90-day
25 moratorium and they're concerned and I believe that we should

1 took, take the time dig a little bit deep. The sound study
2 seems to be a very hot topic, because if they make any noise,
3 especially infrasound, my wife has systemic lupus so I'm
4 worried about that, even if it's not right next to us. So,
5 we really, really need to get the facts straight and I've
6 looked on like the FDA websites as far as the height and I've
7 asked this before five out of the eight that's being purposes
8 are listed at 494 feet, two of them are 284, which is
9 (inaudible). I was told that was a typo. I don't know how a
10 typo can get their five times, especially with FFA paperwork.
11 You need to get it right the first time around and if we had
12 got it right the first time around we would be in this mess
13 right now, and I think the community would be more willing
14 to accept it but because, and maybe genuinely things were
15 done in error, but now it promotes this era of distrust. So,
16 that's all I wanted to say. Thank you.

17 **ROB MACKENZIE:** My name is Robert McKenzie. My wife and
18 I live at six two five two Bower Road in the town of Hector.
19 The Black Oak Wind Farms DSEIS. First of all, my wife and I
20 have this common interest in alternative forms of green
21 energy (inaudible) heat pumps (inaudible). On a professional
22 level, as some of you know (inaudible) involving work on
23 quantitative risk assessments in projects and situations with
24 a potential for (inaudible) the surrounding community. With
25 that personal and professional background, I've been

1 (inaudible) Black Oak preparatory leads and spent several
2 hours reviewing many of the aspects of the revised draft
3 environmental impact statement with (inaudible) and staff,
4 who (inaudible) understanding their diligence and their care
5 for both the human and the natural environment, particularly
6 with regards to set backs and noise ordinance. I believe
7 this (inaudible) here is reflected in the (inaudible). I
8 therefore would like to offer my expression of support and
9 congratulations to the Enfield Town Board's recent move to
10 accept the (inaudible) as, as substantially complete
11 (inaudible) and response support of this important issue.
12 Thank you.

13 **BRAD CONNORS:** Good evening. My name is Brad Connors.
14 First, I would like to thank you for the, this opportunity to
15 speak. I've lived in this community now over 40 years.
16 Several community members here tonight are friends I've made
17 while here in this community. I'm (inaudible) here now to
18 offer the public incite on facts of significant importance,
19 facts very clear that one cannot understand how they might be
20 overlooked. For many reasons those aware of these remains
21 slightly and they may chose out of fear of repercussion,
22 frustrated believing there effort is in vane or personal
23 quests in doing what they believe is right. For some, they
24 are bound by contract or allegiance to a group organization
25 institution or government I see poor distinct results in the

1 end. The first one is what I believe is most likely based on
2 the what I see at this time, wind turbines installed with a
3 significant negative impact on the community in terms of
4 (inaudible). Two, wind turbines installed with a significant
5 impact regarding safety and health concerns. In addition,
6 this will likely increase the current hostilities between
7 community neighbors. Three, wind turbines, wind turbines
8 with negligible impact regarding safety and health, after
9 time (inaudible) and accepts this. Four, wind turbines are
10 not installed in this community until more research is done
11 to accurately safe limits widely accepted in the industry. I
12 discovered seven significant facts during my research on my
13 (inaudible) with significant knowledge and influence that
14 have not endorsed this project, only supported the concept of
15 wind energy. Is science gold? Is there a (inaudible)
16 benefit we have over looked. Let's exam the end results
17 mentioned earlier. The project, the projects does not have
18 investors and proponents who academia and the intellectual
19 community totally unaffected receiving no benefit whatsoever.
20 Two, the project (inaudible) with negligible impact regarding
21 safety and health concerns. Area where turbines are now
22 located is now a neighboring researching actuary for
23 continuing studies on the impacts of wind energy on a
24 community. Three, project happens with significant impact in
25 all aspects realizing now far too little research has been

1 done on the impacts of wind energy. This will drive a
2 tremendous out pouring of funding to better understand and
3 develop new guidelines going forward. Well positioned with a
4 completely developed nearby research sanctuary complete with
5 live specimens making research (inaudible) locally is absurd.

6 **UNKNOWN:** Thank you.

7 **MIMI MEHAFFEY:** Hi my name is Mimi Mehaffey and I live at
8 115 West Enfield Center Road. I'm a member of the, I'm an
9 alternative member to the Enfield wind advisory committee,
10 but I'm not speaking as a member. I'm speaking only as
11 myself. A fellow committee member, Mike (inaudible), said
12 something at our last me that really stuck with me. What I
13 heard him say that we were running out of time (inaudible) so
14 I was driving home seeing all the signs and I became clear to
15 me. This issue has divided the town like no other that I've
16 ever seen, husband to wife, mother to daughter, neighbor to
17 neighbor, friend to friend particularly in my case. Both
18 sides care about the same stuff. I hear from both how deeply
19 they care about their town and the world they live in. All
20 of us give the ticking time bomb of climate change. We need
21 to stop finding things we don't agree on and find things we
22 do. Everyone here agrees we need to cut the CO2 we
23 (inaudible) to our atmosphere. So I say let's stand down.
24 Let's fire our lawyers and our technical experts. Let's
25 stand together and take whatever megawatts of electricity

1 that the wind facility was supposed to produce and instead
2 commit to cutting that same number or more from our lives.
3 The problem of climate change will not go away if our
4 solution is to produce more. The constant need for more has
5 gotten us into this mess to begin with. As I'm sure all of
6 you are aware, we Americans use double the electricity of
7 most of the developed countries per person. Why not join
8 forces and use our brains and our money and most importantly
9 our passion and go person to person, door to door and reduce
10 our electric use. There is power in numbers. We could do
11 this. Look at all the energy in this room? We need to seize
12 the moment and not let this opportunity pass. The need for
13 sacrificed has been raised a number of times in the past few
14 months. The sacrifice needs to come from all of us, not just
15 one small part of one small town. Let the story of Stone
16 Soup, let's brings, let's all bring something to the pot and
17 feed everyone. Think of (inaudible) and think of (inaudible)
18 that would be and I'll bring the bread.

19 **JOHNATHAN COMSTOCK:** Hi my name is Jonathan Comstock. I
20 live at 114 Bald Hill School Road in Caroline, and I too am a
21 little concerned about the divisions that (inaudible) in the
22 community. I am very concerned about a lot of the
23 information and distorted information, misinformation that is
24 being actively spread. I was very disturbed by the very
25 first testimony tonight. A gentleman who goes on about sixty

1 decibel sound as if the wind mills were expected to make
2 sixty decibel sounds at anyone's home. There's a map in the
3 back that clearly shows that level of sound is not going to
4 be heard at anyone's home. He goes to say that forty decibel
5 sound and a sixty decibel sound will add to a hundred decibel
6 sound. Sounds don't work that way. They do not add in that
7 kind of a fashion. This is the kind of exaggerated hype that
8 we are getting. Some of the testimony that has occurred in
9 front of the wind advisory committee has been along the same
10 kind of exaggerated and distorted lines in the matter. I am
11 concerned that if the wind mill is built that these are
12 creating divisions that don't need to be there. The studies
13 are very clear that the sound levels are safe, that the
14 (inaudible) the setbacks are sufficient for all mannerisms.
15 Extensive studies have shown in the original SGIS that it is
16 safe for wild life, for wet lands, for the ecology of the
17 area and with the changes that have been suggested in
18 supplemental EIS do not change any of those fundamental
19 findings. So, I hope the board will find a way to go forward
20 to (inaudible) accurately information about these issues.
21 Thank you.

22 UNKNOWN: Please don't close with comments, let's be
23 respectful.

24 UNKNOWN: (Inaudible) and we were very contentious back
25 at that time. We had just moved here. It was about almost

1 thirty years ago. So we have some (inaudible) we need to
2 stop doing this. We need to start listening to each other.
3 We need to start looking at the facts. Yeah, we need to cut
4 out CO2 use, absolutely. Is that going to be enough? We
5 need to look for alternative sources as (inaudible) and as
6 often as possible. What I found I was searching through some
7 of this material that you people were, are talking about on
8 the web, but there are a lot of sources out there that are
9 not, not really viable sources. There is a lot of
10 (inaudible) in various places on the web. It's important to
11 look at where your information is coming from and be certain
12 that you're coming from some place that's, that, from, from a
13 source that's, that's (inaudible) that's a good source. I
14 also think that we might be (inaudible) some of you who are
15 worried about the sound levels to check out (inaudible) check
16 out (inaudible). Go up there and see what it sounds like. I
17 have heard that we have some of the best and newest wind mill
18 (inaudible) power sources and some of the best technology,
19 the quietest technology and (inaudible).

20 UNKNOWN: Could you please give your name, please?

21 UNKNOWN: And I live up on 429 Hines road.

22 UNKNOWN: Thank you.

23 UNKNOWN: Good evening. I'm Greg (inaudible), I live in
24 the town of Ithaca and I appreciate this opportunity to
25 address the board and my neighbors. What isn't under the

1 preview of the SEIS is the environmental impact of not
2 employing all the renewable resources that we have. I heard
3 on the news this morning that there are twenty seven thousand
4 abandoned oil wells in the Gulf of Mexico. To me that's, I
5 can't imagine twenty seven thousand. The environmental
6 impact of that is significant, but when we're not employing
7 our solar alternatives and renewables we are asking for the
8 status quo, business as usual, more drilling, more mining.
9 So, I, my heart feels the pain of the neighbors whose
10 immediate house location and work location is impacted by the
11 wind turbines and noise, the fear of ice flying, but my
12 feeling is that if we're going to use energy we need to be
13 reasonable for where it's produced and how it's produced,
14 because if we don't employ renewables we're asking people to
15 mine, to drill. It's very dangerous, but it's thousands of
16 miles away. You know? There's going to be seven thousand
17 abandoned oil holes in the ground, but they're going to start
18 leaking some You know, some of them are from the nineteen
19 forties. So my feeling is yes it's going to hurt some people
20 locally and I don't feel good about that, but for the greater
21 good I really feel that we need to employ the alternatives
22 and take responsibility for how we use our energy and where
23 it comes from. Thank you.

24 **TAMMY ALLING:** I'm Tammy Alling and I live on 203 Hines
25 Road. I've been a resident, this is my 20th year on Hines

1 Road for a (inaudible). My parents were both raised in
2 Enfield. I'm a volunteer at the park company. I was vice
3 present of the PTA at the school. I have three children that
4 went through Enfield school. I have one at Boynton and one
5 at the high school now. I worry every day about their carbon
6 foot print, but do I want to sacrifice the land that I love
7 up there, no. My parents have property on Connecticut Hill
8 Road. I love that property. They never built it because
9 they get more snow and my parents would never want to drive
10 from there in the winter time. That might be mine someday.
11 I can see, I will be able to see I don't know how many
12 turbines. It makes me sick. My, my grandparents would be
13 rolling in their grave if they knew and I'm sure some of
14 these other peoples' would be too, but everybody makes their
15 choices. My family has too and it's been very, very
16 difficult. We don't talk about it because of this; my
17 friends, same thing. This has torn us apart. My neighbor
18 across the road, the house has been vacant for over a year,
19 the neighbor up the road has decided that since my sign was
20 out for safe turbines that they decided to put their turbine
21 sign across from me where nobody resides. Their choice. I
22 didn't take it down. Everybody has their choices in life. I
23 grow a garden. I do things to save the earth as much as
24 possible. I love this town. It's why I'm a, I'm a community
25 member. Half this room are investors. The Cornell will get

1 what, most of the grid, most of the green out of it, besides
2 investor you actually will see this. I like the idea of the
3 internet and then I read what well we need internet because
4 you need it for the turbines. It's not because they're
5 trying to give it to the people of Enfield. The fifteen
6 thousand dollars a year I believe I read it'll be a total of
7 forty five thousand for a community building on leased school
8 property, this school property and every Ithaca school
9 property has lead in their water, my children have drank.
10 Should we think about that? What about that? That's your
11 future. That's my future, hopefully to take care of me some
12 day. Think about that when you think about this turbine.

13 **BEVERLY GINGERICH:** My name is Beverly Gingerich. I
14 live with my husband and four children at 101 Rumseyville
15 Road. I really wish I could point out to you where it is on
16 the map, because four weeks ago, I mean four months ago
17 yesterday we were about a block from the farm. I had heard
18 about it in the past years, read a couple articles in the
19 newspaper and just not even being pursued maybe because of
20 where the (inaudible) tower was that all turbines were going
21 to be on the west side of Black Oak road. Can you imagine my
22 shock when a concerned neighbor came and told me the day
23 after Thanksgiving of last year that where the turbines were
24 going to be and I went home and got on the internet and found
25 the maps and low and behold four all within point five to

1 point seven six miles of our home and now possibly two more
2 about a little less than a mile away. Yeah, you say people
3 say that what you read on the inter line, on the internet
4 can't necessarily be believed, but when I read that people
5 are leaving their homes, boarding them up, can't sleep, have
6 headaches, sleep deprivation, fatigue, stress, panic,
7 depression, anxiety, irritability, memory dysfunction, yes
8 I'm worried. We have six people in our house, maybe only one
9 of us will be affected, but to me that's concerning and the,
10 the noise, audible sound may not affect us. We may live far
11 enough away, but it's the low frequency inaudible sound
12 generated by turbines which is concerning to me and I know
13 that the investors and Black Oak Wind Farm likes to call
14 themselves community owned, but if they don't already know I
15 would like to make them aware that according to the copy of
16 this letter date September seventeenth two thousand fifteen
17 sent from Ms. Wells to the Tompkins County industrial
18 development agency the so called community own Black Oak Wind
19 Farm will be sold in it she asked for a transfer (inaudible)
20 and tax abatements to a new owner and says that the project
21 is being sold to onyx black oak wind, LLC, who was able to
22 procure tax equity. So, I just hope the board will make the
23 decision with the interests of the residences who live in the
24 Connecticut Hill area rather than based on money. Thank you.

1 **MIKE ERHART:** Hi, I'm Mike Erhart. Excuse me. I've
2 lived on Connecticut Hill all my life. I've been there 67
3 years. I've been a farmer all my life up there on that hill
4 and noise, yes we have a lot of noise up there. It's the
5 wind. Today, I can hear it over top of my TV in my house.
6 You are not going to hear the wind towers. My son had
7 stopped at a wind tower farm on his way traveling in western
8 New York and he said between the birds and the wind he was
9 right up to the towers you could not hear. You had to wait
10 till the gust of wind quieted down and intensely listen over
11 the birds you could hear the noise (inaudible). They don't
12 make (inaudible). There's three in the purposed on my farm
13 possibly four. I will work right up to the base of these
14 towers with my equipment, harvesting hay, harvesting
15 buckwheat. I'm not afraid of them. I've done my research
16 years ago when this project start before I signed on the line
17 leasing my property. It's not all the panic and concern that
18 everybody here has. It's a given. All the negativity,
19 you've listened to people that have the negativity and all
20 the concerns out there, it's because of the people that are
21 trying to put an end and the other people that have made all
22 the documentation of how safe they are, scientist have done
23 research. It's all there if you look on the other side of
24 how safety they are. The ice, it drops down. It don't fling
25 fifty, a hundred feet and you (inaudible) and if there's ice

1 on them they're sensitive to that. They notice they're
2 flicking ice all over the place (inaudible). This technology
3 has really advanced all the time (inaudible) advance and if
4 anybody's concerned about the environment again as far as
5 (inaudible) electricity, my electric bill is \$55.00 a month.
6 I don't know how much lower you can get then. The automobile
7 that kills our pets, our children and wild life every day.
8 We talked about (inaudible) noise (inaudible).

9 **DAN FLERLAGE:** My name is Dan Flerlage. I live at 881
10 Bostwick Road (inaudible). I've been sitting at the back of
11 the room and I'm watching this, I've been watching this
12 (inaudible). As people speak to one side or the other of
13 this divisive endeavor I watch peoples' heads agree or
14 disagree. I'm sure I'm doing the same thing. I'm a teacher.
15 I've been a teacher for over thirty years. I work with our
16 local kids, Enfield kids, kids from the city of Ithaca, other
17 municipalities. I teach Ecology Biology. If you look at the
18 systems, the natural systems but also human systems and we
19 compare them. My high school students are quietly terrified,
20 every day. They know that our conversations and our meetings
21 and ultimately our decisions will dictate a great deal of
22 what their future will be like. Change is a given.
23 Actually, rapid change is a given. Mother earth is telling
24 us that a lot of what we're used to, comfortable with, and
25 except just won't work for a whole lot longer. We have to do

1 something. If Mimi Mehaffey suggestion that we could
2 substitute all of our efforts, which is doable, she's right,
3 she's absolutely right all of our efforts to equalize the
4 shift in our abuse of fossil fuels and the result of climate
5 change that it will bring to our kids, that would be a
6 wonderful thing. I'm skeptical. We're too used to that.
7 We're too used to our patterns of life. It would be
8 difficult. Change has to happen. I was proud of this
9 community, I was very proud of this community when we talked
10 about fracking. We, we passed the a moratorium. We were
11 part of what created the change in attitude the only lead to
12 a state ban. Bill just came out in the paper that extenuates
13 exactly how right we were, exactly how dangerous a lack of
14 such a moratorium ban at the state level will be to our kids.
15 We have to accept change. It's going to be differential. It
16 always is differential and this town will be front line
17 families that have to put up with something that looks
18 different, sounds different, feels different, is different.
19 We have to make the change people. All of us. I really
20 employ that you feel that in your, in your soul. We don't
21 have to rush. We have to do.

22 **MARY KOBLER:** My name is Mary Kobler, (inaudible) Bald
23 Hill School Road in Caroline. I have been following this
24 very closely. I care about Enfield. There are people here
25 that I know and love, and I've been going to the committee

1 meeting and I have been distressed by the committee. The
2 acoustic engineer who went (inaudible) has credibility as an
3 acoustic engineer. He was not supposed to be commenting on
4 health issues, which he has no credibility on. His findings
5 have been thrown out of every court that he tries to testify
6 in and yet people in the community are just hanging on the
7 health issues. I'm an insomniac. That's why I've been
8 reading so widely on these issues. A year ago, I was hit
9 with vertigo that had me down for a week, and I don't live by
10 a wind farm. That thing that have, you have to remember when
11 reading studies is, yes there are people that are going to
12 have insomnia but, by wind farms. Yes there are people who
13 are going to have headaches and every other possible illness.
14 The issue is how is that related to the rest of the public?
15 You know, you have to, you, you cannot just say oh everybody
16 that has headaches by a wind farm sign up for this study.
17 That is not how (inaudible) and really, really ask the
18 community to just look how epidemiological studies work and
19 how much of that you are hearing from this committee. We
20 have to get our energy from somewhere. I'm part of energy
21 dependent Caroline. We are really suffering with our tax
22 dollars decreasing and if we could have this wind in, in
23 Caroline we'd take it in a heartbeat. We're losing our rural
24 ambulance service because our tax base just can't handle it
25 anymore and that is a big concern for us. There are school

1 dollars that are going to come from where? This is like
2 peoples, I heard somebody say this is a sacrifice
3 (inaudible). You have the gold folks. You have the resource
4 of the future here in Enfield. You are the winners. Anyway,
5 I really care about this community and I hope that you will
6 see that all of the studies have been done. That's what's
7 been taking all these years and nothing has changed with this
8 draft, this new draft environmental impact statement. Please
9 move ahead before (inaudible) run away. Thank you.

10 **MARAGUERITE WELLS:** Maraguerite Wells, 863 Hayts Road,
11 and project manager for Black Oak as you know. Having been
12 working on this project for nine years now, it has always
13 been part of our approach to make it something that Enfield
14 would be proud of and it would be (inaudible) and so that is
15 why so many people have invested and that is why we gave a
16 more generous pilot agreement than anyone (inaudible)
17 because we're not trying to be stingy. We're trying to share
18 and give tax dollars and make improvements to our town.
19 That's why we're offering to fix the road after we put up
20 (inaudible) it. I would (inaudible) other businesses in this
21 town that have at least (inaudible) property values as I
22 think the wind farm will have and till the town (inaudible).
23 You can build anything you like right up to your property
24 line. So you know (inaudible) pig farm and his next door
25 neighbor (inaudible). You know, there's nothing that he can

1 do (inaudible) his pigs (inaudible) and that has had a
2 pretty serious impact on his neighbor (inaudible) yes it's a
3 free country and he's a free man and so to, to pin too much
4 on the wind farm that we don't pin on anyone else's in this
5 town seems like an unfair burden especially since we have a
6 lot to contribute adding to the taxes, fixing the roads,
7 putting hundreds of thousands of dollars into local people's
8 pockets with lease payments and the good neighbor agreements.
9 And so they come at us with I would like to ask the question,
10 what are you offering the town? How are you going to add to
11 the tax base? Are you doing to fix the roads? Are you going
12 to put money into your neighbor's pockets? I think Mimi's
13 proposal of cutting energy use is a great one, but it doesn't
14 go far enough really. We can only address this (inaudible)
15 things. This project is really about helping Enfield to
16 become a real land mind and have something to be really proud
17 of if we had this wind farm in the same way the town of
18 (inaudible). I just spent about a week in Northern New York
19 where there is, there are four towns that have four wind
20 projects and five wind turbines and they've been living with
21 those turbines the people there for seven years and I
22 (inaudible) the town and I talked to people throughout it and
23 I didn't run into a single person whose been living next to
24 wind turbines for seven years who had a problem. The whole
25 town supported it. Every single person you talk to, they

1 love the tax benefits, they have no property taxes in those
2 towns anymore and they just said we can't wait for more
3 turbines to get built. That is the attitude of the people
4 who actually live there. What we've purposed in this draft
5 EIS was a response to some land owners concerns, trying to be
6 compromising to say look you didn't like the original
7 approved layout, a few of you had concerns here's a change
8 from the original (inaudible) we're doing our best to
9 address your concerns. We can't address everyone's concerns.
10 We can't make everybody happy (inaudible). May other
11 developers would even bother would even bother doing that.
12 Thank you very much.

13 **UNKNOWN:** So, I'm Sarah (inaudible). I live on
14 (inaudible) in Caroline and I've lived in Tompkins County for
15 last 36 years. So, I'm a support of the wind farm. I
16 understand that these are big issues and you want to have
17 adequate setbacks, but we do. The wind farm has spent a lot
18 of money from hiring engineers and other experts who've
19 advised them about the placements so that it would not have a
20 big impact an of the (inaudible). The purposed changes do
21 not change any of that. The original proposal was approved
22 and I would strongly urge the town board to approve the minor
23 changes that are being purposed. I would like to point out
24 to the people who are opposed to the wind farm that there's a
25 lot of misinformation out there. The first people who spoke

1 today talked about adding 60 decibels and 40 decibels and
2 getting a hundred decibels. As any freshman engineer would
3 tell you, sound doesn't work that way. Decibels are a
4 logarithmic scale when you add 60 and 40 you get slightly
5 more than 60. Besides that, the numbers sixty and forty
6 (inaudible).

7 UNKNOWN: (Inaudible).

8 UNKNOWN: I'm addressing points that were made earlier.

9 UNKNOWN: (Inaudible).

10 UNKNOWN: The town board put out some guidance here
11 (inaudible).

12 UNKNOWN: Wait (inaudible).

13 UNKNOWN: (Inaudible).

14 UNKNOWN: Another misconception that was pointed out,
15 another misconception that was before is that (inaudible).
16 Okay they are doing the world a favor be finance (inaudible).
17 Okay, infrasound was another issue that was raised.
18 Infrasound is by definition sound that you cannot hear. It's
19 made by wind. It's made by waterfalls. It's made by your
20 refrigerators. Okay, some of you, when I talked to some of
21 you before (inaudible) infrasound that's bad for you. You
22 refrigerators make infrasound too. So I would urge the town
23 board to please go ahead very quickly approve the changes.

24 MARCUS GINGERICH: My name is Marcus Gingerich, 101
25 Rumsey Hill Road. I am an engineer by trade. I work in

1 research. So, I am somewhat familiar with engineering
2 concepts. I'm also familiar with research, research papers,
3 I've worked in the peer review process. I thought you might
4 find it interesting to know that Albert Einstein had one peer
5 reviewed paper out of several hundred. So, apparently you
6 can write good papers without them being peer reviewed. I'm
7 not saying peer review is bad. I've been involved in it.
8 It's a little disconcerting. I would like to say a couple of
9 things about the SE, or whatever this is by now. There is a
10 proposal to move two of the turbines potentially near my
11 location. I live with my wife, four children. We currently,
12 in the current configuration would have four turbines within
13 about a kilometer, or a little less. With the proposed
14 configuration, which I have to take the worst case, which
15 means two of them will be going in Enfield, we would have six
16 within less than a mile of my home. Basically, (inaudible) a
17 nice array. So, we're going to get hit in any direction of
18 the prevailing wind. Now, I know a lot of people say in
19 (inaudible) Black Oak and there EIS says infrasound is no
20 issue, because Jeffrey (inaudible) says it's no issue.
21 There's actually reports in his own testimony in front of a
22 public service commission where he accepts that it can have
23 affects. Now, do wind turbines produce infrasound? Yes. Is
24 it the same as a refrigerator? Probably not. It's
25 impulsive. It occurs at a very low frequency. To say that

1 we cannot hear it at those levels is probably correct.
2 However, there are studies that show FLIR, EEG that the human
3 brain, when subjected, when a person is subjected to
4 infrasound in the bands, in the frequencies that wind
5 turbines produce the human brain responds, even though they
6 do not hear it. So to say that we do not physiologically
7 respond to infrasound from wind turbines would seem to be
8 false. These are peer reviewed studies. The other thing
9 that I generally found in peer reviewed studies is that there
10 is the noise from wind turbines and sleep disturbance. To
11 say that sleep disturbance is just a little problem is, seems
12 a little weird because sleep is so important. The University
13 of Rochester Medical Center, my time? Well I'm just saying
14 University of Rochester Medical Center has shown lack of
15 sleep can cause (inaudible) damage.

16 **ERIC GASTEIGER:** Hi I'm Eric Gasteiger. I'm 37
17 Connecticut Hill Road (inaudible), but there's a few things
18 that people brought up that are quite fascinating to me. I
19 do realize that we need clean energy. There's no question
20 (inaudible), things like that, but there's a lot of concerns
21 I have. Number one that really sticks to my mind is the
22 proposed substation (inaudible) is actually on a property
23 that joins. I've got no official notification at all that
24 the Black Oak Wind Farm is going to be spreading around as
25 far as it is. Years ago, when it was first proposed, they

1 put up this test turbine and that's when myself and my father
2 who is now 96 remembers where that was going to be. Since
3 (inaudible) that property owner decided he didn't want it.
4 Okay. Sound, people are talking about infrasound and
5 (inaudible). I'm a permanent sufferer of tinnitus, twenty
6 four hours a day, seven days a week. The way that elephants
7 (inaudible) to communicate over long distance was through
8 infrasound. (Inaudible) research (inaudible) they actually
9 felt this in their body and they recorded this sound speed it
10 up and there it was. Does it damage peoples' hearing? I
11 have no way of knowing. I've looked at the studies from both
12 sides. There aren't enough studies. The other thing that
13 (inaudible) two days (inaudible) or three days, sorry, it's
14 last week. The number of birds and bats killed are excused
15 by New York State, or sorry, by the US fishing and wildlife
16 (inaudible) that they say it's not a problem. You know, one
17 scientist testified in front of Congress and said there is a
18 major problem, relatively two point four million, four
19 million bats and birds are killed every year by humans. So I
20 ask the board (inaudible) society become (inaudible)
21 possible, yes. So these are very major concerns for me. We
22 talked about the ice being thrown or something like that, the
23 survey of the bird kills underneath the turbine is something
24 like two hundred yards that they found through a study that
25 actually carcasses could be thrown up to 500 and some yards,

1 but those aren't put into the studies because they, sorry
2 (inaudible) studies because (inaudible) two hundred yard
3 leeway. Thank you.

4 **JERAD JONES:** Hi my name is Jerad Jones and I live in
5 the town of Ithaca, about five miles east on Route 79. I
6 live in a community where we have to make a lot of decisions
7 together and one of the bottom lines that we frequently have
8 to deal with is when you make a proposal can people live with
9 it? Can other people live with it even though it may not be
10 a perfect proposal? And it's, it's, in that community, we
11 often have to ask and appreciate the we'd rather than the me
12 and that's what I think we're talking about with the town of
13 Enfield and the community of Enfield. We think that's the
14 way you should be looking at it too and the last thing, I
15 think it was (inaudible) thing is if we always do what we
16 we've always done, we'll always get what we've always got.
17 We can't keep doing the same thing and move ahead. We've got
18 to make some changes (inaudible). Thank you.

19 **UNKNOWN:** Anyone else?

20 **GARY FISHER:** Gary Fisher, I live on Buck Hill Road.
21 First, I, I'm really disappointed in the town board not
22 enforcing the rules as far as people not addressing the
23 people who have spoken. I think you should have stood up for
24 that. I guess, the one thing that concerns me is that
25 obviously there's going to be impact on the person

1 (inaudible) and the safety individuals when there's
2 construction and I think the, there may be some physical
3 adversity to the individuals, but most certainly there are
4 going to be some mental issues and I think that you really
5 need to take that into consideration. People are living
6 close by and they're going to be impacted whether it's you
7 know mainly physical or mental, but obviously the mental will
8 be there, the increased stress which has an adverse health
9 affect and I think that needs to be really addressed
10 (inaudible) major issue when deciding whether or not to go
11 forward. Thank you.

12 **SUZETTE SHULTS:** Good evening. Thank you for this
13 opportunity to speak this evening. My name is Sue Shults.
14 I'm a local educator in the community and my family and I
15 built a home on Black Oak Road about eight years ago. I've
16 attended many board meetings to stay informed and I've also
17 done research on my own. Turbine five's location is a
18 concern to my family, my property and my home. It's close
19 proximity causes a concern for all these issues that have
20 been mentioned tonight, but specifically ice blade throw.
21 The nearest corner of my property line is only five hundred
22 and forty nine feet away. GE has recommended the setback
23 distance of nine hundred and eighty nine feet if icing is to
24 occur. So GE must consider ice, icing to be a concern if
25 they have set this distance at that. Other scientists and

1 studies have recommended even further setback distances to
2 remain safe from icing issues. At least half my property
3 will be vulnerable to ice considering only GE's
4 recommendations. Unfortunately, I cannot move my property.
5 I cannot move my home. To me it's simple math. There is
6 just not enough room to safely install and industrial
7 windmill farm on Black Oak Road. Thank you.

8 **UNKNOWN:** (Inaudible) 183 Griffin Road, my grandparents
9 built Newhart's Lodge. We lived right close to it. This
10 project's far from being safe at all. It's, the wind towers
11 are 493 foot tall and they go them (inaudible) two hundred
12 and (inaudible). I just ask the board to reconsider
13 (inaudible). Thanks.

14 **CHAD NEWHART:** Chad Newhart, I live on 146 Griffin Road.
15 The Newhart's are my family too. We all live up there. I
16 just ask the town board to do their job for the residences
17 and not the investors and give us safe setbacks, please.

18 **UNKNOWN:** My name is (inaudible) Fisher. I live at 377
19 Harvey Hill Road at the corner of Black Oak and Harvey Hill.
20 I'm not going to argue any of the points that are going on
21 here. I'm, you have your ideas. You've come to the
22 conclusions by now. But, it is very difficult when you're
23 not one that normally gets up and speaks and right now my
24 concern of living where I live is I suffer from severe
25 migraines. I'm suffering from one now. So, bear with me,

1 whatever comes out. I also have depression that I suffer
2 from. I am not allowed to work. So you say this noise is
3 not going to be a bother. I'm going to have it twenty four
4 seven, every single day, every single night. If there's a
5 flicker, I will see it every single day, every single night.
6 We have built our, well we didn't build our house, Gary
7 (inaudible). Gary's my husband's cousin. We bought the
8 house that we live in from my husband's grandparents. Don
9 had the farm up there, three hundred plus acres. We've made
10 a sanctuary of our house. We put all kinds of money from the
11 estate (inaudible) killed a few years ago into bringing this
12 house up. We've made a sanctuary with birds, with animals so
13 I can have solitude so I can live, see this pristine
14 beautiful landside knowing I live in the Finger Lakes with
15 beautiful mountains, beautiful lakes, solitude and wonderful,
16 wonderful people. We just made our last 30 year mortgage
17 payment. The property is ours (inaudible). I can't afford
18 to go. We're in retirement in two years. The gentleman that
19 was talking about the people that lived, that wanted to give
20 it to their children to divide that ten acres, give them five
21 each, that's us. For 30 years, that's been our intention.
22 We would take our two acres and house, they would have the
23 field in the back. Are they going to be able to do that now?
24 No. They're too close. They can't build. For 30 years,
25 we've given our life, we've worked our hearts out, we've

1 lived on this land and now it's worthless, except Donald and
2 (inaudible) Fisher and Brian are buried on that land. We
3 would like to be buried on that land. We won't, will we? If
4 our house is worthless we will leave the town of Enfield and
5 go someplace where our lives, and our home and our family are
6 not worthless.

7 **UNKNOWN:** Anyone else? I guess we'll call the hearing
8 and close. Remember that April 12th is the next public
9 hearing for comments and you can submit written comments to
10 the town also or extend what you were not able to complete
11 here in your three minutes. Thank you.

12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

IN THE MATTER OF: Town of Enfield (Public Hearing on Black
Oak Wind Farm DSEIS

LOCATION: Town of Enfield

DATE: Monday, March 28, 2016

I, Karyn Baker, certify that the foregoing transcript of
the Town of Enfield (Public Hearing, 3/28/2016, on Black Oak
Wind Farm DSEIS, was prepared using electronic transcription
equipment and is a true and accurate record of the
proceedings.

Signature: Karyn Baker

BAKER TRANSCRIPTION SERVICE
321 Troy Road
Ithaca, NY 14850
(607) 207-6332

Date: 5/11/2016